CITY OF PALM BEACH GARDENS  
PLANNING, ZONING, AND APPEALS BOARD  
Agenda Cover Memorandum  

Meeting Date: April 9, 2019  
Petition No. PPUD-14-12-000038  

Subject/Agenda Item:  
Rezoning and Site Plan for the Ballenisles East Outparcel  
Public Hearing & Recommendation to City Council:  
A request from EW Outparcels, LLC to rezone a 5.27-acre site located at the southeast corner of PGA Boulevard and Ballenisles Drive from Neighborhood Commercial (CN) to Planned Unit Development (PUD) overlay with an underlying zoning designation of CN. The Applicant is also requesting Site Plan approval for a 60,000-square-foot, 2-story medical and professional office building.

[ ] Recommendation to APPROVE  
[X] Recommendation to DENY  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reviewed by: Planning Manager</th>
<th>Originating Dept.: Planning &amp; Zoning: Project Manager</th>
<th>Finance: Accountant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peter Hoffheinz, AICP</td>
<td>Dawn C. Sonneborn, AICP Senior Planner</td>
<td>Tresha Thomas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development Compliance And Zoning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahareh Wolfs, AICP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Director of Planning and Zoning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natalie M. Crowley, AICP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Attorney</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R. Max Lohman, Esq.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| [ ] Quasi – Judicial [ ] Legislative [X] Public Hearing |
| Advertised: [X] Required [ ] Not Required |
| Date: 3/29/19 Paper: The Palm Beach Post |

Funding Source: [ ] Operating [X] Other N/A  
Budget Acct.#: N/A  

Contract/Agreement:  
Effective Date: N/A  
Expiration Date: N/A  

Affected parties: [ ] Notified [X] Not Required  

PZAB Action: [ ] Rec. Approval [ ] Rec. Approval with Conditions [ ] Rec. Denial [ ] Continued to: ______  

Attachments:  
- Development Application/Narrative  
- Location Map  
- Development Plans  
- Turn lane improvement exhibits  
- Capacity Letters  
- Traffic Statement, Palm Beach County, City Traffic Consultant Letters  
- Ballenisles Community Association letter of objection  

Approved By: City Manager  
Ronald M. Ferris
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

A request from EW Outparcels, LLC to rezone a 5.27-acre site located at the southeast corner of PGA Boulevard and BallenIsles Drive from Neighborhood Commercial (CN) to Planned Unit Development (PUD) overlay with an underlying zoning designation of CN. The Applicant is also requesting Site Plan approval for a 60,000-square-foot, 2-story medical and professional office building. The Applicant’s project is inconsistent with the City’s Comprehensive Plan and does not meet the requirements of the City’s Code. Staff is recommending denial.

BACKGROUND

Although the subject property is known as the BallenIsles East Outparcel, it is not located within the BallenIsles Planned Community Development (PCD). The subject property has a Commercial (C) Future Land Use designation, and a Neighborhood Commercial (CN) zoning district designation. The subject property and the vacant property to the west across BallenIsles Drive were owned by John D. MacArthur at the time of the BallenIsles PCD approval. It was purchased by EW Outparcels, LLC in 2006.

In June 2009, the East Outparcel received a conditional traffic concurrency approval for 71,000 square-feet of professional office use from the City and Palm Beach County, contingent upon the southbound left turn lane on BallenIsles Drive to be redesigned to maximize its vehicle storage capacity. The approval required the Applicant to obtain site plan approval from the City Council by December 2011. The Applicant did not submit an application for review and therefore, did not obtain approval by the deadline and the conditional traffic concurrency expired.

The subject site is vacant and has native vegetation and landscaping in the 55-foot landscape/parkway buffer along PGA Boulevard. The site has a few trees on-site in the southern portion, which are mostly exotic invasive species. There is an existing southbound left turn lane on BallenIsles Drive with a median opening to serve the project.

The Applicant submitted this petition in 2014 and has requested numerous Planning, Zoning, and Appeals Board postponements throughout the process. The Staff concerns that are noted in this report have remained generally consistent throughout the Development Review Committee process of this petition.

(The remainder of this page intentionally left blank)
LAND USE AND ZONING

The land-use designation of the subject site as shown on the City’s Future Land Use Map is Commercial (C) with a zoning designation of Neighborhood Commercial (CN). The project is located in the PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay District. The existing land uses and zoning designations of the properties surrounding the subject site are provided in Table 1.

Table 1: Existing Zoning and Land-Use Designations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXISTING USE</th>
<th>ZONING</th>
<th>FUTURE LAND USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subject Property</td>
<td>Neighborhood Commercial (CN) and PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay District</td>
<td>Commercial (C)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballenisles East Outparcel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>Planned Community Development District (PCD)</td>
<td>Residential Medium (RM)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old Palm Planned Community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development (PCD)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>Planned Community Development District (PCD)</td>
<td>Golf (G), Residential Medium (RM) &amp; Residential Low (RL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballenisles Planned Community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development (PCD)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East</td>
<td>Planned Unit Development (PUD)/Neighborhood Commercial (CN)</td>
<td>Commercial (C)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PGA Concourse Office Building</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longwood Condos</td>
<td>Residential High (RH)</td>
<td>Residential High (RH)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West</td>
<td>Residential Low – 3 (RL-3)</td>
<td>Residential Low (RL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballenisles West Outparcel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCURRENCY

Traffic

The Applicant submitted a Traffic Impact Analysis, dated August 10, 2016, for a previously proposed 65,000 square foot medical office building. The Palm Beach County Traffic Division reviewed this analysis and issued a letter of approval dated August 22, 2016, with a requirement of a proportional share payment of 13.17% of the construction cost of adding an additional southbound right turn lane at PGA Boulevard and Central Boulevard through a Proportional Share Agreement.

After the Applicant revised the site plan to a 60,000 square foot building, the Applicant submitted a Traffic Equivalency Statement, dated October 6, 2017, to change the project from a 65,000-square-foot medical use office building to a 60,000-square-foot medical use office building. The Traffic Equivalency Statement indicates the development will generate 2,168 daily driveway trips, with 143 daily AM peak-hour driveway trips, and 184 PM peak-hour driveway trips. Palm Beach County reviewed the equivalency statement and provided a letter of approval, dated December 11, 2017. This letter states that all
other conditions of approval as contained in the County's previous August 22, 2016 approval letter remain valid. In addition, the Applicant requested a build-out time extension from Palm Beach County, under the provisions of Section 252.363, F.S, which is based upon declaration of a State of Emergency. The County issued an approval of the time extension in a letter dated January 23, 2019. This letter provides a new build-out date of December 23, 2020.

**Solid Waste, Water, and Wastewater**

The Solid Waste Authority (SWA) has provided a letter, dated January 10, 2018, that disposal capacity is available to accommodate solid waste generation from the proposed site. The Seacoast Utility Authority (SUa) has provided a water and wastewater capacity letter, dated December 21, 2017.

**Drainage**

The Applicant submitted a Drainage Statement with the subject petition that was reviewed and accepted by the City's Engineering Department. The property is located within sub-basin 4 of the BallenIsles Conceptual Master South Florida Water Management District (SFWMD) Permit, and is in the "off-site undeveloped areas" as indicated in the permit. This assumed the site to be non-residential and predominately impervious. The proposed drainage will include a system of inlet storm pipes and a 0.11-acre dry detention area in the southeast corner. Pre-treatment will meet the requirements of the SFWMD criteria prior to discharging into the North Palm Beach County Improvement District’s (NPBCID) lake system and ultimately into the C-17 canal.

**PROJECT DETAILS**

**Existing Site**

The subject site is 5.27-acres and has one point of ingress and egress from BallenIsles Drive, with an existing southbound left turn lane and median opening to serve the proposed project access. The site is currently vacant and has native vegetation and landscaping in the existing 55-foot-wide landscape/parkway buffer along PGA Boulevard. There are existing trees that are on-site in the southern portion of the parcel that are mostly invasive exotic species.

Residential dwelling units within the abutting Longwood Condominiums development are located approximately 20 feet from the subject parcel in the southeast corner. The BallenIsles PCD immediately abuts the east, south and west parcel lines, with the closest single-family homes within BallenIsles located approximately 760 feet to the south of the subject parcel. A 6-foot-high decorative wall with a wall fountain, landscaping, and decorative trellis, exists approximately 18 feet west of the subject site’s western property line within the 200-foot BallenIsles Drive right-of-way owned by the Northern Palm Beach County Improvement District (NPBCID). An 8-foot-wide sidewalk exists along the west side, located outside of the decorative wall along BallenIsles Drive, and an existing 6-
A foot-wide meandering sidewalk is located within the existing 55-foot landscape/parkway buffer along PGA Boulevard.

**Proposed Project**

The Applicant is proposing a 60,000-square-foot medical and professional office building. The mix of uses is predominately medical office with 57,600 square feet of medical office and 2,400 square feet of professional office. The project has only one point of ingress and egress from BallenIsles Drive. A secondary stabilized access point is proposed for life safety vehicles on PGA Boulevard for emergency purposes only.

**Parking and Loading**

The project requires a total of 296 parking spaces with professional office use at 1 space per 300 square feet requiring 8 parking spaces, and medical office at 1 space per 200 square feet requiring 288 parking spaces. The project has been designed with the minimum total of 296 parking spaces. Two loading spaces are proposed at the west side of the building.

The Applicant is proposing reduced parking stalls at 9.5 feet by 18.5 feet. A minimum of 10 feet by 18.5 feet is required by code. Reduced parking stalls require an aisle width of 25 feet as set forth in City Code Section 78-344(m), Table 32, when proposing reduced parking space widths. City Code Section 78-344(l)(2), *Criteria for Reduction in Parking Space Dimensions*, allows parking spaces to be reduced in size if additional open space is provided, and if the reduction enhances the appearance of the site. The Applicant has provided landscape parking diamonds throughout the parking lot, and the project proposes 34 percent open space (that includes the required 55-foot parkway buffer) where the City's Code requires a minimum of 15 percent.

**Project Landscaping, Landscape Buffers, and Open Space**

The parking lot landscaping will include Gumbo Limbo, Live Oak, and Green Buttonwood trees in the end islands, and Silver Buttonwood and Dahoon Holly in the proposed landscape diamonds. In addition, there are Magnolia, Ligustrum, Sweet Bay, Pink Tabebuia, and Bald Cypress trees, and shrubs such as Cocoplum, Fakahatchee Grass, Small-leaf Clusia, and Silver Saw Palmetto. Foundation plantings consist of Medjool Date Palms, Royal Palms, and Double Trunk Montgomery Palms. Although the site technically meets the landscape code, there are opportunities for the Applicant to provide additional landscaping throughout the site such as groundcover, flowering plants, and decorative grasses in areas that are proposed with only sod that would improve the overall aesthetics of the project.

The existing PGA Boulevard buffer landscaping will remain with additional landscaping added such as Slash Pine trees and Cabbage Palmetto Palms, including a pedestrian amenity area with pavers, benches, and trellis cover for shade.
The proposed landscape buffers are as follows:

- A 20-foot-wide landscape buffer with existing landscaping is provided along the west property line, which is adjacent to the existing wall and landscaping along Ballenisles Drive. Additional Royal Palms are proposed to be added in the northwest corner of this buffer.
- A 15-foot-wide landscape buffer is proposed along the south property line, adjacent to the vacant Tract GC-3 in the Ballenisles PCD.
- A 15-foot-wide landscape buffer is proposed along the east property line adjacent to the residential Longwood Condominiums with an 8-foot high opaque PVC white fence.
- A minimum 8-foot-wide landscape buffer is provided along the remaining east property line adjacent to the PGA Concourse office building.

Landscaping within the buffers will consist of Southern Live Oaks, Silver and Green Buttonwoods, Gumbo Limbos, and Cocoplum shrubs. Bald Cypress trees are proposed along the north side of the dry-retention area in the southeast corner. The project meets the minimum open space required for the project and provides approximately 34% open space.

**Site Lighting**

The site design includes 25-foot-high lighting poles along all interior access drives and drive-aisles within the parking areas. The sidewalk in the buffer along PGA Boulevard will have a combination of 12-foot-high pedestrian-scale light poles, and 3.5-foot notched LED bollards. In addition, wall sconces are proposed at the main entry on the north elevation, with recessed lighting on all other entrances. The Applicant’s proposed photometric plan meets the requirements of Section 78-182 of the City’s Land Development Regulations.

**Art in Public Places (AIPP)**

Pursuant to Section 78-261, *Art in Public Places Requirements* of the City’s Land Development Regulations, all development where total vertical construction costs are equal to or greater than $1,000,000, requires the Applicant to provide art, or payment in lieu of, in the amount of one percent (1%) of the total vertical construction costs. The Applicant will need to meet this requirement. A condition of approval will be included requiring the Applicant to meet this code requirement.

**Signage**

The Applicant has indicated that a central lobby will provide tenant signage in the proposed building. However, no building or ground signs are proposed with this petition. Since project signage can impact the buildings architectural character, future signage must be submitted by the Applicant through a separate petition for a master sign program. Wayfinding signage for this access will be particularly important being accessed from Ballenisles residential access road.
Architecture

The proposed 2-story building will have a combination of concrete tile hip roof and flat parapet roof styles. The color palette ranges from light beige to browns. The maximum building height at the midpoint of the hip roof is 36 feet. In accordance with City code, building height is considered to be the vertical distance measured from the existing average grade elevation at the base of the building to the highest point. For the proposed hip roof design, the highest point is measured at the average height between eaves and peak of the hip roof. The building is proposed in the northwest corner of the site to be built up to the 55-foot parkway buffer. The width of the building along the PGA Boulevard frontage is 267.5 feet in width and 116.6-feet in depth. The design of the building at over 267 feet wide does not propose any significant recesses or building separations to break up the building mass. The building proposes finishes such as textured stucco, gray stone, raised bands, tile medallions, columns, stucco banded windows, metal awnings, balconies with black aluminum railings, and windows with gray glazing and charcoal color frames.

PROJECT AND REZONING ANALYSIS

The proposed project has several outstanding issues. The intensity of the project at 60,000 square feet of medical use, along with the associated traffic concerns, the proposed architecture, and the overall design and massing of the project have not been adequately addressed by the Applicant, along with inconsistencies with the intent of the CN zoning district. This intensity, mass, and scale is also inconsistent with other sections of the City's code that are explained in further detail in this report. These unresolved issues are inconsistent with the City’s Land Development Regulations and the Comprehensive Plan, more specifically described in this section.

Intensity and Traffic

As detailed in the Concurrency section of this report, the Applicant's proposes a 60,000-square-foot medical office building that will generate 2,168 daily driveway trips, 143 AM Peak Hour trips, and 184 PM Peak Hour trips. Although the Applicant has received traffic concurrency approval from Palm Beach County, a number of vehicular flow and circulation issues remain outstanding, primarily because access to the site is limited to Ballenisles Drive. This is a private road and not considered or required as part of the traffic analysis for traffic concurrency.

(The remainder of this page left intentionally blank)
Based on the safety concerns of the potential peak hour traffic that is based on the proposed use, and in order to mitigate the impact of these trips at the proposed intensity, Staff and the City’s traffic consultant are requiring the following improvements:

- **Extend the Southbound Left-Turn Lane on BallenIsles Drive.**
  This existing turn lane has approximately 135 feet of storage with a 75-foot taper (210 feet overall length) and is located at the subject site entrance. This turn lane is to be extended to 170 feet of storage with a 50-foot taper.

- **Extend the Eastbound Right-Turn Lane on PGA Boulevard at BallenIsles Drive.**
  This existing turn lane has approximately 90 feet of storage with a 170-foot taper (260 feet overall length). It is to be extended to meet the minimum Palm Beach County turn lane standards of 280 feet of storage, with a 50-foot taper.

- **Extend the Westbound Left-Turn Lane on PGA Boulevard at BallenIsles Drive.**
  This turn lane has approximately 300 feet of storage with a 235-foot taper (535 feet overall length) with a future dual left turn lane stripped-out. The existing single turn lane is to be extended to meet the minimum Palm Beach County standards (for the future dual turn lanes) of 450 feet of storage, with a 100-foot taper.

- **Optimize Traffic Signal Timing at PGA Boulevard and BallenIsles Drive.** Based on the traffic impact statement provided by the Applicant and reviewed by the City, the project’s intensity generates enough vehicle trips that this intersection will operate at an unacceptable level of service and will require the signal timing at this intersection to be modified to address the additional trips placed at the intersection.

The Applicant has agreed to construct the above listed improvements. While these improvements may improve the operations of the intersection of BallenIsles Drive and PGA Boulevard, there are impacts to the existing median and road shoulder landscaping and irrigation, and possible impacts to the existing sidewalk and water main along PGA Boulevard at the proposed extended eastbound right-turn lane. The Applicant has provided conceptual drawings of this turn lane that show the proposed taper impacting the edge of the sidewalk. This may require the sidewalk to be relocated behind an existing 41-foot by 42-foot gas easement in this area. The Applicant has met with Seacoast Utility Authority and has agreed to relocate the water main lines if necessary. The area of possible sidewalk relocation is within the BallenIsles West outparcel and is under the same ownership as the subject parcel.

The right-of-way of BallenIsles Drive is owned and controlled by the North Palm Beach County Improvement District (NPBCID), and their consent is required to make any roadway improvements. In order to ensure that the project’s driveway connection onto BallenIsles Drive operates safely, the City Engineer will require the site distance lines to be maintained at the appropriate height and visual clearance to ensure vehicle driver visibility while entering and exiting this project. As shown on the Applicant’s landscaping plan, there is an existing large and mature Ficus tree located just south of the project entrance that has multiple root trunks extending down the main trunk. These root trunks
extend 7-feet into the site distance triangle on the northbound approach to the projects entrance. Removal of this large, mature tree for vehicular sight safety will affect the existing landscaping aesthetics of BallenIsles Drive in this area.

In addition to the recommended roadway improvements, cross-access to the adjacent PGA Concourse office building to the east side was recommended by Staff and was included as a requirement by the City Council with the PCD approval in 1989. However, the Applicant has not been able to obtain approval by the adjacent property owner for this shared access.

Although staff acknowledges medical office is a permitted use, the proposed intensity of the project remains a significant concern. The intensity of the proposed project is not consistent with City Code Section 78-146, CN - Neighborhood commercial district, and Section 78-153, Table 12 for the CN district. The CN zoning district requires that a project is compatible with the surrounding zoning districts, and states that the intent is to be "composed of land and structures occupied by or suitable for uses furnishing retail goods and services to satisfy the daily household needs of the surrounding residential neighborhoods consistent with the comprehensive plan. These districts shall locate on a collector or near the intersection of two collectors and shall be small and conveniently located for most of the adjacent residential areas. The district regulations are designed to permit the development of the districts and to protect the surrounding residential areas requiring that certain minimum standards comparable to those called for in the residence districts". (emphasis added)

The proposed intensity of a 60,000-square-foot medical office building site abutting existing residential units on a portion of the east, and residential zoned parcels on the west and south, is not consistent with the CN zoning district intent. The CN zoning district permits a minimum lot size of 1 acre and a maximum of 3 acres in size per Section 78-153, Table 12. The parcel size exceeds this code, containing 5.27 acres. This is a legal nonconformity based on when the parcel received its zoning designation in 1994. The Applicant acquired this property in this condition.

The parcel is 2.27 acres, or 76% larger than the maximum parcel size of 3 acres that is permitted by the CN zoning district development standards. The larger acreage size is allowing this project to be proposed at a larger and more intense size and scale beyond the intent of the CN zoning district at a maximum of 3 acres. By comparison, the abutting PGA Concourse parcel to the east is consistent with the intent of the CN zoning district. It is zoned PUD/CN and contains 2.95 acres with 34,000 square feet of professional and medical office use, and compatible with the existing residential character of the surrounding area.

The intensity of the proposed project is not consistent with the purpose and intent of the Planned Unit Development Overlay District in City Code Section 78-154(a), nor is it consistent with the PGA Boulevard section of the PUD code, specifically in Section 78-154(g)(1)(6). The purpose and intent of the PUD overlay district is to provide architectural and design features which are aesthetically pleasing and supportive of
enhanced quality of life, and provide one or more specifically-identifiable benefits to city residents, and to ensure that development occurs according to limitations of use, design, density, and coverage. (emphasis added) The intensity of a 60,000-square-foot medical office building that immediately abuts residential zoning districts on three sides with only one entry point from BallenIsles Drive in a CN zoning district does not support or enhance the quality of life for the surrounding residential communities. This is due to the site’s limited access being only from BallenIsles Drive and adding 2,163 daily driveway trips. This will negatively impact the existing residential character and does not support the existing quality of life for the BallenIsles residential community. The proposed project does not provide a specifically-identifiable benefit to residents with the proposed level of intensity, building mass and scale, increased traffic congestion, and required roadway improvements. The projects impact to BallenIsles Drive will negatively affect the existing landscape aesthetics, overall character of the roadway, and quality of life for surrounding residents by removal of the large, mature, Ficus tree within the line of site distance south of the project entry for public safety purposes. In addition, there are opportunities for the Applicant to provide additional landscaping throughout the site such as groundcover, flowering plants, and decorative grasses in areas that are proposed with only sod that would improve the aesthetics of the project.

The City’s PUD code for PGA Boulevard, specifically in Section 78-154(g)(1)(6), states that “all development along the PGA Boulevard Corridor shall be restricted to and promote and preserve the character of the corridor”. The surrounding area is residential in character, and the proposed intensity, mass and scale, and significant amount of daily driveway trips to the project site on BallenIsles Drive does not promote or preserve the existing character of the area. The proposed project within this surrounding residential character area does not “promote and preserve the character of the corridor”, and will actually detract from the area’s character and quality of life as previously noted, and is therefore, not consistent with this section of the code.

Architecture

The proposed architecture lacks the required high quality and architectural compatibility that is required by the City’s Land Development code, especially for new construction along the corridor, and is therefore inconsistent with City Code Section 78-221, PGA Boulevard Corridor overlay district, which states: In recognition of the city’s desire to create special character and aesthetics for this corridor, planning and design guidelines and particular uses are established for the PGA Boulevard corridor. The planning and design guidelines are intended to achieve the objectives listed below.

a. Create a special identity for PGA Boulevard through the use of planning and design standards.

b. Ensure high quality, architecturally compatible, consistently landscaped development along the corridor.

c. Regulate uses within the corridor which will create a specific character and aesthetic quality for the corridor.
d. Ensure that new development or redevelopment projects preserve and enhance the existing visual character of the corridor. (emphasis added)
e. Promote and protect the health, safety and general welfare of the city.

The project has not met the requirements of the code described specifically above. The building mass, at over 267 feet in width, does not enhance the existing visual character of the corridor. The use of architectural design techniques of recesses, impactful vertical and horizontal breaks of the building plane, and roof lines to lessen the impact of the building’s size, mass, and scale could be added to significantly improve the design. In addition, the use of more modern and high quality materials could substantially improve the architectural design.

The proposed architecture also does not meet the intent of the City’s Design Guidelines for Non-Residential Development. Under the General Provisions section, there are design guidelines that encourage the use of architectural features and patterns that provide visual interest such as projections and recesses that would break up the massing of the proposed building with over 267 feet in width. The design components and planning principles provided in the City’s Design Guidelines specifically emphasizes applying these elements to high-visibility locations such as the PGA Boulevard Corridor.

**Mass and Scale**

The design of the building as it relates to the mass and scale is not compatible with the character of the adjacent area. The large rectangular shape of the building at 267.5 feet long and 40-feet high at the highest peak of the roof is comparable to the design of the office and commercial buildings along PGA Boulevard that are located east of Interstate 95 around the Gardens Mall. The area that is adjacent to this project is primarily one- and two-story single-family homes, one- and two- story multifamily residential buildings, smaller individual mixed use and commercial buildings between 9,000 and 25,000 square feet. These projects include the PGA Concourse, PGA Commons, First Republic Bank, Earth Fare Grocery store, the former Bank of America building, along with residential projects such as BallenIsles, Old Palm, Longwood Condo, and Hampton Cay. Both these non-residential and residential projects have buildings that are broken up into multiple buildings and incorporate vertical and horizontal breaks, recesses, and courtyards to break up the mass and scale of the respective projects. In addition, further west of the subject site, west of Florida’s Turnpike, is the Fairway Office Center consisting of two buildings that have been designed with a maximum building length of approximately 175-feet. These buildings are further setback from the PGA Boulevard corridor and set on an angle with a large lake to buffer the views of the buildings. These buildings are located within an area that is surrounded by Commercial and Professional Office land use on all sides.

The mass and scale of this project is more appropriate for a commercial area like the area located around the Gardens Mall and the Regional Center. This area includes buildings such as the Seacoast Bank Building (68,000 SF), Grand Bank Center (45,000 SF), Chase Bank Building (76,000 SF), and the Florida Cancer Center (75,000 SF).
INCONSISTENCY WITH THE CITY’S COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

The Applicant’s request for a rezoning, as well as the proposed site plan is inconsistent with the overall intent of the Goals, Objectives, and Policies of the City’s Comprehensive Plan. Some of the key goals, objectives and policies are summarized below:

Future Land Use Element (FLUE) Goal 1.2.: Encourage development or redevelopment activities, while promoting strong sense of community, and consistent quality of design; and do not threaten existing neighborhood integrity and historic and environmental resources. (emphasis added)

Staff Comment: The proposed project negatively impacts the existing neighborhood character and integrity of the area. As noted previously, the intensity, massing, and scale of the proposed project is not consistent with the specific CN zoning district, PUD overlay district, and PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay sections of the City’s land development regulations as more specifically referenced in this report.

FLUE Policy 1.1.2.5.: PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay: A PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay shall be maintained in the City’s Land Development Regulations in order to establish the PGA Boulevard Corridor as the City’s “main street”. The character, magnitude, aesthetics, and uses to be developed or redeveloped on PGA Boulevard are of special interest.

Staff Comment: As more specifically described in this report under the Architecture section of this report on Page 10, the proposed architecture does not meet the PGA Boulevard Corridor Overlay, City Code Section 78-221. The architecture lacks the required high quality, unique character, and aesthetic quality, for expected new construction along the PGA Boulevard corridor.

FLUE Policy 1.1.3.4.(a): The City shall maintain land development regulations which provide for a Planned Unit Development (PUD) technique which shall implement the following concepts:

a. The intent of a Planned Unit Development (PUD) is to ensure the desired character of the community is furthered or enhanced on development sites within the City, particularly on sites where the development proposed is rather intense. Master plans for Planned Unit Developments include, at a minimum, site plans showing all local roads and landscaping plans. (emphasis added)

FLUE Policy 1.2.4.: Direct future growth, development and redevelopment to areas as depicted on the Future Land Use Map, consistent with: sound planning principals; minimal natural limitations; the goals, objective, and policies contained within this Comprehensive Plan; and the desired community character. (emphasis added)
FLUE Policy 1.2.4.11.: The City shall encourage infill and redevelopment of existing properties with consideration of the following:

1. Address the impact of redevelopment activities on natural systems and any historic resources.
2. Provide for visual continuity of the community through the application of sound principles of architectural design and landscaping. (emphasis added)
3. Be consistent with the character of the neighborhood. (emphasis added)
4. Reduce existing non-conformities or alternatively demonstrate that adverse impacts will not be created. (emphasis added)
5. Be consistent with Section 723.0612, Florida Statutes, related to mobile home parks and include relocation strategies for those residents displaced by the implementation of the plan, which ensure that the displaced residents are provided adequate notice, equitable compensation and assistance in locating comparable alternative housing in proximity to employment and necessary public services and/or provide a minimum percentage of replacement housing on site.
6. Encourage affordable and workforce housing as a component of redevelopment projects.

Staff Comment: The proposed use of the subject site is not consistent with the "desired community character" as noted in these policies, by virtue of the intent of the existing CN zoning district on the parcel. The intent is for uses to be "small" and "suitable for uses furnishing retail goods and services to satisfy the daily household needs of the surrounding residential neighborhoods", as specifically noted in City Code Section 78-146, CN – Neighborhood commercial district. A 60,000-square-foot medical office building on 5.27 acres does not meet the intent of the CN zoning district. As previously noted on Page 9, this parcel contains approximately 2.27 acres more than what the current CN zoning district allows at a maximum of 3 acres. With the proposed site design maximized at the 5.27 acres, the project is more comparable to higher intensity zoned parcel, such as a Professional Office (PO) zoning district. This is not compatible with the surrounding area. The proposed architecture is not consistent with the "visual continuity of the community through sound principals of architectural design" as stated in this Policy. This is evident with the proposed architecture not meeting City Code Section 78-221, and not consistent with the intent of the City's Design Guidelines for Non-Residential Development, as explained earlier under the "Architecture" section of this staff report. The design components and planning principles provided in the City's Design Guidelines specifically emphasizes applying to high-visibility locations such as the PGA Boulevard Corridor. The intensity of the proposed use is not consistent with the "character of the neighborhood" as stated in number 3 of this Policy. The change in the landscape character along PGA Boulevard and Ballenisles Drive, due to the required roadway improvements may be impacted and possibly diminish the overall character of the surrounding area.
COMMENTS FROM THE DEVELOPMENT REVIEW COMMITTEE (DRC)

The subject petition was reviewed by the DRC committee on February 18, 2015. At this time, a number of outstanding comments remain, which are all specifically described in this report.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends **DENIAL** of petition PPUD-14-12-000038, based on the following findings of fact:

- Inconsistency with the City’s Comprehensive Plan.
- Inconsistency with the intent of Section 78-146, *CN Zoning District*.
- Inconsistency with Section 78-154, *Planned Unit Development overlay district*.
- Inconsistency with Section 78-221, *PGA Boulevard Corridor overlay district*.
- Inconsistency with the intent of the City’s *Design Guidelines for Non-Residential Development*. 